Minutes of the Called Meeting of the Presbytery of Transylvania

First Presbyterian Church, Winchester, KY

May 1, 2018

The called meeting of the Presbytery of Transylvania met at First Presbyterian Church, Winchester, KY, on Tuesday, May 1, 2018. A quorum was present.

Summary attendance: teaching elders present: 34; teaching elders excused: 8; teaching elders absent: 29; ruling elders present: 17; ruling elders excused: 2; churches with ruling elders absent: 60; commissioned ruling elders present: 2; commissioned ruling elders excused: 2; commissioned ruling elders absent: 8; coordinating commission members present: 3; presbytery staff: 1; visitors present: 1. (See Appendix A.)

Moderator David Hoskins called the meeting to order at 5:35 PM. The Stated Clerk moved the docket. Second, and motion passed. The Presbytery began its meeting with worship and proclamation of the Word.

The Moderator called for the report of the Church Closing/Dismissal Commission. The commission moved that the Presbytery of Transylvania dismiss the First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg, to the Evangelical Presbyterian Church as outlined in the attached Dismissal Agreement. Motion passed.

The commission moved that the Presbytery of Transylvania concur with the request of the congregation and session of the Chapel Hill Presbyterian Church to dissolve the church; that the Administration Commission/Trustees be charged with the financial and physical maintenance and upkeep of the property; that the Coordinating Commission, working with the Church Revitalization and Development Ministry, study and propose uses for the building and grounds, reporting progress at each presbytery meeting; and that the final worship service of the Chapel Hill Presbyterian Church be on Sunday, May 20, 2018, at 11 AM. Motion passed.

Worship resumed with the Sacrament of Communion. There being no further business to come before the Presbytery, the Stated Clerk moved that the Presbytery be adjourned. Second, and motion passed. The Moderator spoke a prayer and blessing and ended the meeting at 6:35 PM.

Submitted:

The Rev. Jerry L. Utt, II

Stated Clerk

Minister Sign-In Sheets Called Meeting May 1, 2018 First Presbyterian Church Winchester

83

MINISTER ATTENDANCE P = present; EX = absent; A w/o EX = absent without excuse; HR = honorably retired

Anderson, The Rev. Rachel	
*Baker, The Rev. Darryl	
Beachy, The Rev. Duane	Excused
Benedetti, The Rev. Sara	MARIO
Benze, The Rev. Keith	4030
*Berry, The Rev. Woody	
Blankenbeker, The Rev. James	
Bradney, The Rev. Ryan	Ra B
*Bright, The Rev. Peggy	
*Brooks, The Rev. Dr. Gary	
Brothers, The Rev. Michael	
*Bunger, The Rev. Ron	
*Butler, The Rev. Angie	
Cervas, The Rev. Scott	
*Chamberlain, The Rev. Pat	
Christian, The Rev. Curtis T.	Con Contraction

Cauca Meec.
May 1, 2018
First Presbyterian Church
Winchester

*Chumney, The Rev. David	
Clark, The Rev. E.G.	
Clark, The Rev. Patterson	
Conlee, The Rev. Kerry	
Crawford, The Rev. David	Dawl a Crayford
*Daniel, The Rev. Dr. E. Randolph	
Davis, The Rev. Mark	
Denney, The Rev. Michael	Mul
Dermody Jr., The Rev. Roger	Excused
*Deutsch, The Rev. William L	
*Divas, The Rev. Dr. L. Armando	
Ehlert, The Rev. Kristy	
*Ensminger, The Rev. Douglas	
*Erwin, The Rev. James	
Eye, The Rev. Lisa	Din R. Ze
*Eyster, The Rev. Bert	
Falco, The Rev. Matt	MADL

*Fiscella, The Rev. Dr. Ruth	
Foehse, The Rev. Caitlin	
*Furrow, The Rev. F. Dewitt Jr	
*Gailey, The Rev. Carol	
Garrod-Logsdon, The Rev. Beth	Excused
Gilbert, The Rev. Anthony	Excused
*Gilbert, The Rev. James	
*Gnatuk, The Rev. Wayne A	
*Gordon, The Rev. Graham	
*Griffie, The Rev. Dr. L. Fred	
Groome, The Rev. Thomas	
*Guerrant, The Rev. Richard	
*Haga, The Rev. R. Jackson	
Hans, The Rev. Dr. Daniel	
Harris, The Rev. Cindy	excused
Hartsfield, The Rev. Karen	Kne fruttfis
*Henery, The Rev. Dr. James	

*Hibbard, The Rev. Maurice	
*Hicks, The Rev. Roy	
Hood, The Rev. Dr. Fred	,
*Howard, The Rev. Scott	Sett a. Hermand
Howie-Kipphut, The Rev. Lorilyn	Afterine - Lyphul
*Huffman, The Rev. Gary	
*Iversen, The Rev. Eric	
Johnson, The Rev. Jennifer	
*Jones, The Rev. Jon F.	
Kelly, The Rev. Joel	excused
Kim, The Rev. Yongwha	
Kupar, The Rev. Greg	Greg Kip
Lattimore, The Rev. John	7
Lee, The Rev. Hyeon Gu	Injenter
*Lindberg, The Rev. Jackie	
Lotspeich, The Rev. Philip	FRY X
Love, The Rev. Jane Ann	Que Ro

Maconochie, The Rev. Linda	Suda Maconochiu
Majors, The Rev. Phil	
*Malott, The Rev. Fred	
*Matthews, The Rev. Griffith	
*McAtee, The Rev. Dr. William M.	
*McGlawn, The Rev. Burt	
*McGowan, The Rev. Bryce L.	
McIntyre, The Rev. Hannah	
McKnight, The Rev. Laurie	cexcused
*Mendenhall, The Rev. Ray	Ray Menterhall
*Mesta, The Rev. Edward Hugh	0
*Moffett, The Rev. Howard W.	Howard W. Mystett
*Mount, The Rev. Dr. C. Eric Jr	
Mumper, The Rev. Jay	Fall
*Murray, The Rev. Charles M.	
Noel, The Rev. Tim	(in Host
Olive, The Rev. Wanda B.	Wanda B. Olive

Olt, The Rev. Julie	Julie City
Olt, The Rev. Schuyler	U
Pace, The Rev. Steve	Str. of Hard
race, the Rev. Steve	gaw su
Pachuau, The Rev. Kima	
*Palmer, The Rev. Stephen	
*Pettijohn, The Rev. Bonnie	
Phillips, The Rev. Griffin	
*Pogue, The Rev. Philip	
*Prewitt, The Rev. Janet	Sout Printy
*Rasmussen, The Rev. Dr. Kenneth	
*Redmond, The Rev. Katherine	
*Reed, The Rev. Mary	
*Rhodes, The Rev. Dr. Steve	
Riley, The Rev. Kathy	Kathy Riles
*Roberts, The Rev. F. Morgan	
Robinson, The Rev. Dr. Jack H	Jack Buches Robinson
Rouse, The Rev. Erin	Dade Robinson excused

*Rucker, The Rev. Dr. Jim Sr.	
Rucker, The Rev. Dr. Jilli St.	
Rucker, The Rev. Pamela C.	
Sanders, The Rev. Dr. Stephen A.	
Schmidt, The Rev. Tammy	
Scott, The Rev. Dr. Geary Neal	
*Sevier, The Rev. Dr. Melissa	
*Shaffer, The Rev. Robert	
Shrauner, The Rev. Ryan	
Silence, The Rev. Jay T.	D. H.
*Smith, The Rev. Joanne	
*Spickler, The Rev. Harry	
Stamper, The Rev. Janice	
*Stanley, The Rev. Donald	ples 2. En Ja.
*Steiner, The Rev. Betsy	
*Stewart, The Rev. Jim	
*Stricklin, The Rev. Dr. Ernest	

*Tarter, The Rev. Dr. Rollin	
Thompson, The Rev. Gene	
Thro, The Rev. Julie Urback	
Utt, The Rev. Jerry L. II	South
*Vanzant, The Rev. William	
Ward, The Rev. Michael	present
*Warren, The Rev. Susan	Mill Wid
Weese, The Rev. Mary Seeger	
*Weis, The Rev. Richard	Dichard D. 190 min
White, The Rev. John C.	John Chilly
*Wilhelm, The Rev. Jack	
Williams, The Rev. Susan	Jusal William
*Woodring, The Rev. James	
	·

Commissioned Ruling Elders May 1, 2018 First Presbyterian Church, Winchester

Excused
excused
James 1 00 Jun
Thellow On Med
-Presbyterian Supply
present

Ashland, First	
Ashland, Normal	Roy Stein
Augusta	
Augusta, Sharon	
Bellefonte, Community	
Beattyville, McGuire Mem.	
Berea, Whites Memorial	
Blackey, Doermann Mem.	
Booneville, First	
Buckhorn, Buckhorn Lake	
Canada, Highland	
Carlisle	
Catlettsburg, First	
Cawood	
Corbin	Charles und plotion
Cow Creek	
Cynthiana	
Danville	Jean Herry
	Tita Bloom
	Paggy Tudit

Darfork, Hull Memorial	
Dry Hill, Anna C. Brush Mem.	
Ezel, United	
Flemingsburg, First	
Frenchburg, United	
Georgetown, First	
Grayson, Bayless Memorial	
Greenup	
Harlan, First	
Harrodsburg, United	
Hazard, First	15 Mom gen youts
Indian Creek	
Isom	
Jackson, Guerrant Memorial	
Lancaster, First	·
Lawrenceburg, First	
Lexington, Beaumont	MIKO KICCI



Lexington, Bethel	
Lexington, Chapel Hill	Jane Osban
Lexington, Eastminster	,
Lexington, First	
Lexington, Hunter	Anne Chesnut
	cally martin
Lexington, Lex. Korean	
Lexington, Maxwell Street	
Lexington, Meadowthorpe	
Lexington, Mt. Horeb	
Lexington, Second	Karen S. May
	<i></i>
Lexington, Walnut Hill	

London, First	
Manchester	
Mays Lick	
Maysville, First	
McAfee, New Providence	
Middlesboro, First	excused
Midway	
Millersburg, First	
Morehead, Faith	Diehl Ackerman
Mt. Sterling, First	
Paint Lick, Old Paint Lick	
Paris, First	Rogers Bards
Paris, Hopewell	
Perryville	Excused
Pikeville, First	
Pineville, First	
Prestonsburg, First	
Richmond, First	

Somerset, First	
Somerset, Pisgah	
Stanford	
Versailles	
Versailles, Pisgah	Jennifer Chandler
Versailles, Troy	Welm A Milly
Washington	
Whitesburg, Graham Memorial	
Wilmore	
Winchester, First	
Winchester, Salem	Doris Stanley

Coordinating Commission Ruling Elders May 1, 2018 First Presbyterian Church, Winchester

Busroe, Katie

Hoskins, David; Moderator

Line, Nell; PW

Woodford, Catesby; Treasurer

Nell Line

Presbytery of Transylvania Visitors May 1, 2018 First Presbyterian Church, Winchester

Print Your Name Roben Justus Linka Cranford	Business Managen Second Presb

Proposed Docket Presbytery of Transylvania Called Meeting May 1, 2018 First Presbyterian Church, Winchester

5:00 PM General Registration

5:30 PM Call to Order David Hoskins, Moderator
1. Declaration of Quorum Jerry L. Utt, II, Stated Clerk

Presentation of Docket
 Worship
 Stated Clerk
 (See Bulletin)

4. Report of Closing/Dismissal Commission

5. Adjourn and Closing Prayer Moderator

Worship Bulletin

OPENING PRAYER (UNISON)

Many: You alone are Lord, Almighty God,

and all that we have and are that is good comes from you.

You have called each of us here.

You have blessed us so

that we might be a blessing to others in the world.

Help us to set aside our selfish desires

so that the church's witness may be for your glory.

Grant us your Spirit

to guide us through the future as you have the past.

Help us listen for your Word of Life

among all the words that we will speak here today.

And may your will be done.

We offer ourselves to your service at this time,

in this place,

for your glory,

through Christ our Lord.

Amen.

OPENING HYMN: #210 "Our God, Our Help in Ages Past"

CALL TO CONFESSION

CONFESSION OF SIN (UNISON)

Many: Merciful God,

in your gracious presence we confess our sin,

and the sin of our church.

Although Christ is among us as our peace,

we are a people divided against ourselves,

as we cling to the values of a broken world.

The fears and jealousies that we harbor

set Christian against Christian.

We abuse your good gifts of imagination and freedom,

your gifts of intellect and reason,

and have turned them into bonds of oppression.

Lord, have mercy upon us;

heal and forgive us.

(Silent Confession)

Set us free to serve you in the world

as agents of your reconciling love in Jesus Christ.

Amen.

Assurance of Pardon

PRAYER FOR ILLUMINATION

SCRIPTURE READING: Romans 12:1-18

SCRIPTURE READING: Isaiah 65:17-24

SERMON

DECISION AGENDA: Report of Church Closing/Dismissal Commission

PASTORAL PRAYER

THE SACRAMENT OF COMMUNION

PASSING THE PEACE

CLOSING HYMN: #560 "We Plow the Fields and Scatter"

MOTION TO ADJOURN

BENEDICTION

Bulletin Notes:

Liurgies for today's service taken from *Book of Common Worship* and *Scriptures for Times of Conflict*, a resource of the Office of Theology and Worship.

Church Closings and Dismissals Commission Report to Presbytery May 1, 2018

The Church Closings/Dismissals Commission moves that the Presbytery of Transylvania dismiss the First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg, to the Evangelical Presbyterian Church as outlined in the attached Dismissal Agreement. The First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg, has requested dismissal from the PCUSA to the Evangelical Presbyterian Church. Over several years, the former Commission on Ministry, an administrative commission, and the Church Closings/Dismissals Commission, have all worked with the church on the various issues involved in dismissing the church. Throughout this process, the church has continued to pay per capita and honor its commitments to the PCUSA.

The Church Closings/Dismissals Commission moves that the Presbytery of Transylvania concur with the request of the congregation and session of the Chapel Hill Presbyterian Church to dissolve the church; that the Administration Commission/Trustees be charged with the financial and physical maintenance and upkeep of the property; that the Coordinating Commission, working with the Church Revitalization and Development Ministry, study and propose uses for the building and grounds, reporting progress at each presbytery meeting; and that the final worship service of the Chapel Hill Presbyterian Church be on Sunday, May 20, 2018, at 11 AM.

AGREEMENT OF DISMISSAL

KNOW ALL MEN BY THESE PRESENTS the parties listed below do enter into this AGREEMENT OF DISMISSAL.

WITNESSETH the party of the first part, First Presbyterian Church, an Association in Catlettsburg, Kentucky and the parties of the second part, Presbyterian Church USA (PCUSA), Synod of the Living Waters and the Transylvania Presbytery of Kentucky and all acts being confirmed by the respective representatives with attached signatures below do hereby enter into this **AGREEMENT OF DISMISSAL** this 1st day of May , 2018.

The party of the first part having requested, pursuant to the Book of Order, to be dismissed from the PCUSA and its respective subdivisions and the parties of the second part, being represented by a Closing Commission from the Transylvania Presbytery, have agreed to the following terms and conditions for the dismissal of the First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg to the Evangelical Presbyterian Church.

TERMS AND CONDITIONS

These terms and conditions of the AGREEMENT OF DISMISSAL shall be recorded in the Boyd County Court Clerk's Office in the Miscellaneous Book.

This Agreement of Dismissal will be referenced in a Deed setting out the terms, conditions, recitals and stipulations that will affect various claims and interests of property located in Catlettsburg, Boyd County, Kentucky which is the place of worship for the party of the first part.

The parties are aware there is potential litigation over the ownership rights and

interests of the real and personal property. In conformity with the Book of Order, and in an effort to avoid prolonged litigation, the parties of the first part and the parties of the second part do hereby agree to the following terms, conditions, recitals and stipulations.

- 1. The party of the first part have voted overwhelmingly to be dismissed from the parties of the second part to Evangelical Presbyterian Church. The Evangelical Presbyterian Church has confirmed with both parties they are willing and have accepted the party of the first part into the Evangelical Presbyterian Church.
- 2. The parties of the second part being PCUSA, the Synod of Living Waters and the Transylvania Presbytery will sign and execute all deeds tendered to them for the purpose of extinguishing any and all claims which they may have and quitclaim all interest to the real property which is the subject of this agreement upon fulfillment of the terms set forth herein.
- 3. The total consideration for the parties of the second part quitclaiming all interest they may have to real property occupied by the party of the first part shall be as follows: The party of the first part, shall, for a period not to exceed ten (10) years but be no less than five (5) years, pay to the parties of the second part fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000.00) in no less than one-thousand five-hundred dollar (\$1,500.00) increments for the ten (10) year period. Upon the fifth anniversary date of the signing and execution of this document, if so desired by the party of the first part, the party of the first part may pay the balance which is owed of the fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000.00), complying with and satisfying all the provisions of this paragraph. This provision is to be considered a lease purchase for the interest the parties of the second part have in land which is the current place of worship for the party of the first part.
- 4. The party of the second part shall have a right of reversion to the party of the first part for a period of ten (10) years which is inclusive of that term of years which is stated in the

previous numerical paragraph three (3). The right of transfer shall terminate on the ten (10) year anniversary date of the signing and execution of this document, so long as all terms set forth herein have been met.

- 5. The right of reversion will only inure to the benefit of the parties of the second part in the event the Evangelical Presbyterian Church dismisses the party of the first part, without the party of the first part going into and being accepted by another reformed denomination. If the Evangelical Presbyterian Church releases the party of the first part to another reformed denomination then no reversion would occur.
- 6. The party of the first part shall obtain liability insurance in an amount sufficient to indemnify and hold harmless the parties of the second part. Any insurance obtained, indemnifying and holding harmless the parties of the second part, shall only be for the purposes of liability. The party of the first part will obtain insurance for property damage and destruction due to fire loss or other catastrophic event. The party of the first part shall be the sole recipient and beneficiary of any and all proceeds of this policy. This paragraph is only to be in affect so long as the parties of the second part have not been fully paid the fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000.00) due from the party of the first part. Upon the payment in full of the fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000.00), the party of the first part has no obligation to obtain insurance listing the parties of the second part as additional insureds.
- 7. Any improvements to the subject property, would be included and transferred to the parties of the second part in the event of a reversion within the ten (10) year period. The parties of the second part will agree to sign any and all documents which are necessary for the purpose of collateralizing the property within the ten (10) year period. The party of the second part shall not be responsible for any debt or expenses related to said collateralization, except to

the extent the property would stand as collateral and security for any indebtedness, loan or mortgage on said property. The remaining balance of the monies owed the parties of the second part under this agreement shall act as a superior claim to any further collateralization and shall not be subrogated to such.

8. Upon the tenth (10th) anniversary of the signing and execution of this document, and upon the fulfillment of all terms contained herein, the right of reversion would cease to exist and the parties of the second part would have no claim whatsoever, to the realty or the improvements thereon. Further, beginning on the date of the signing and execution of this agreement, the parties of the second part will have no claim to any personalty, of any kind and nature, including but not limited too all bank accounts, vehicles, moveable or intangible property, which are in the name of the party of the first part.

This agreement and the provisions contained herein shall apply to, bind, and inure to the benefit to all successors, legal representatives and assigns.

This is the full and exclusive agreement of the First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg, the party of the first part and PCUSA, the Synod of Living Waters and the Transylvania Presbytery, the parties of the second part. The individuals as Trustees and Elders on behalf of the party of the first part have signed solely in their capacity as the representatives of First Presbyterian Church, Catlettsburg. Further, the signatures on behalf of the Transylvania Presbytery, the Synod of the Living Waters and PCUSA are attached and affixed hereto, by persons in their representative capacity as the Board of Trustees with the authority to bind the parties of the second part.

rms agreement represent	s the entire agreement	between the parties. This agreement may
not be changed, amended, altered	d or modified except b	y written document and consent of all
parties.		
WITNESSETH this	day of	, 2018.
CLERK FIRST PRESBYTERIAN CHUI BY AND THROUGH THE TRU		
CHAIR OF THE TRUSTEES TRANSYLVANIA PRESBYTE SYNOD OF THE LIVING WAT PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH US	RY by on on behalf of FERS	f itself and;
COMMONWEALTH OF KENT	TUCKY)	
COUNTY OF FAYETTE)	
The foregoing Agreemen	t was subscribed, ackr 2018, by	nowledged and sworn to before me this, as agent for cky corporation, for and on behalf of the
orporation.	(U.S.A.), Inc., a Kentu	cky corporation, for and on behalf of the
	Notary Pu My comn	ublic nission expires:
COMMONWEALTH OF KENT	TUCKY)	
COUNTY OF BOYD)	
The foregoing Agreemen	t was subscribed, ackr	nowledged and sworn to before me this

		ary Public commission expires:
STATE OF KENTUCKY,		
COUNTY OF BOYD,		
that on this day this Agreement of D	ismissal was ether with this	of the Court for the county aforesaid, do certify received and lodged in my office for record, s and the foregoing certificate thereon ragein my said office.
Witness my hand this	_ day of	, 2018.
		CLERK, BOYD COUNTY
		DEPUTY CLERK

Dear Commissioners of the Presbytery of Transylvania:

At the request of the Chapel Hill Session and Congregation, one of the actions being considered at this called meeting of the Presbytery is the dissolution of the Chapel Hill Presbyterian Church in Lexington, KY. The leaders at Chapel Hill have not come to this decision lightly or quickly. The church has experienced significant declines in membership and worship attendance over the past 10-15 years. They have looked at their community, experimented with new programs and different ways of reaching out. The energy of the leaders and the congregation is at a low point. Finances are stressed and with a \$400,000 mortgage and building maintenance needs on the horizon, it has become an unsustainable situation. We believe their decision is a courageous one. Instead of holding on until the last dollar is spent and the final member leaves, they are living into a faith that speaks of resurrection.

In times like this, the innate desire of those around the Presbytery will be to ask, "Why?". Why did this happen? It's a natural question, and you may have others. The answers and reasons behind this decision are complex and multi-faceted and will take time to discern and, to be honest, are irrelevant in the face of a faithful group of people who have carefully and prayerfully considered their future and concluded that the ministry given to them has been accomplished. As a Presbytery, we may differ on whether this action is the right path for Chapel Hill Church and we all have the right to our own opinion about the matter. Yet the reality is, we trust those at the congregational level to advise us as to the best path forward for their church and the Presbytery.

The Chapel Hill congregation will gather on May 20th to celebrate the ministry and impact of their life together. Our hope is that sister churches across the Presbytery will lift them up in prayer that day. May 27th will be their final public worship service. While we are ending the public witness of the congregation on May 27, 2018, their legacy and impact will last for many generations.

For some, this action will seem sudden and there will be questions about what the Presbytery will do with the property. At this time, we are looking at various options but have not settled on anything. We intend to proceed deliberatively. We understand that if the property is sold, we will be giving up a prime space for future ministry. Once we have done the work and considered the options, the Coordinating Commission and Trustees will bring a recommendation to the Presbytery. We hope to have an update at the August meeting.

It would be appropriate at this meeting if a motion were made to examine the factors and conditions leading to the closure of Chapel Hill and bring findings to a future Presbytery meeting for discussion and consideration. We can learn from the life and ministry of this church and in the process, strengthen our common mission. It would be appropriate that any such motion be referred to the Revitalization and Development Ministry or to a special task force appointed to accomplish this task.

Remember to pray for the Chapel Hill congregation as the closing date approaches.

In Christ,

Philip Lotspeich General Presbyter Jerry Utt Stated Clerk